



SPECIAL JOINT MEETING
**BENICIA HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION
AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT BOARD
CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS**

SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES

**January 11, 2007
6:30 P.M.**

I. OPENING OF MEETING

- A. Pledge of Allegiance**
- B. Roll Call of Commissioners**

HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION

Present: Commissioners Don Dean, Luis Delgado, Toni Haughey, Mike White,
Blythe Wilson and Chair Pat Donaghue
Absent: Commissioner Jim Conlow

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT BOARD

Present: Larry Fullington, Norm Hattich, Suzanne Kleiman, Duane Oliveira, Chris
Strawbridge and Chair J.B. Davis
Absent: Leah Perry-Shelhorn

Staff Present: City Manager Jim Erickson
Contract Attorney Kat Wellman
Senior Planner Damon Golubics
Associate Planner Xzandrea Fowler
Administrative Secretary Gina Eleccion

- C. Reference to Fundamental Rights of Public - A plaque stating the Fundamental Rights of each member of the public is posted at the entrance to this meeting room per Section 4.04.030 of the City of Benicia's Open Government Ordinance.**

II. COMMUNICATIONS FROM AUDIENCE

Jon Van Landschoot, 175 West H Street – He hoped that this is not the only meeting prior to the City Council. He would like to see a number of hearings prior to adoption of the plans.

III. PRESENTATION

A. STRATEGIC PLAN UPDATE

The Assistant to the City Manager will give a presentation on the City's Strategic Planning Process.

Jim Erickson, City Manager, gave an overview of the Strategic Plan process. He asked the community, Economic Development Board and Historic Preservation Review Commission for feedback.

A citizen questioned the Marina Fund and the dredging problems. The City Manager noted that dredging costs have been transferred to Benicia Harbor Corporation.

A question was asked as to how many people were surveyed and what mix of people was surveyed. The City Manager noted that phone surveys were done and 400 people responded.

A citizen asked how much money was set aside for the Commandant's residence. The City Manager confirmed that there is \$900,000 set aside, with additional grant money.

IV. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 7:00 p.m.



SPECIAL JOINT MEETING
**BENICIA PLANNING COMMISSION, HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW
COMMISSION AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT BOARD
CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS**

SPECIAL MEETING AGENDA

**January 11, 2007
7:00 P.M.**

I. OPENING OF MEETING

- A. Pledge of Allegiance**
- B. Roll Call of Commissioners**

PLANNING COMMISSION

Present: Chair Fred Railsback, Commissioners Richard Bortolazzo, Kyle Daley,
Dan Healy, Mike Ioakimedes, Bonnie Silveria, and Scott Strawbridge
Absent: None

HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION

Present: Commissioners Don Dean, Luis Delgado, Toni Haughey, Mike White,
Blythe Wilson and Chair Pat Donaghue
Absent: Commissioner Jim Conlow

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT BOARD

Present: Larry Fullington, Norm Hattich, Suzanne Kleiman, Duane Oliveira, Chris
Strawbridge and Chair J.B. Davis
Absent: Leah Perry-Shelhorn

Staff Present: City Manager Jim Erickson
Community Development Director Charlie Knox
Contract Attorney Kat Wellman
Senior Planner Damon Golubics
Associate Planner Xzandrea Fowler
Administrative Secretary Gina Eleccion

- C. **Reference to Fundamental Rights of Public** - A plaque stating the Fundamental Rights of each member of the public is posted at the entrance to this meeting room per Section 4.04.030 of the City of Benicia's Open Government Ordinance.

II. AGENDA CHANGES AND DISCUSSION

Charlie Knox noted that the Benicia Business Park Draft EIR is available. This will be before the Planning Commission at the February 8th meeting.

III. COMMUNICATIONS FROM AUDIENCE

Stein Erickson, Sahara Restaurant – They would like to open a Mediterranean restaurant at the old Burner's location on First Street. Local artists and craftsmen have been hired to maintain the integrity of Benicia. They will be proposing modifications to the exterior of the building.

IV. CONSENT CALENDAR

On motion of Commissioner Daley, seconded by Commissioner Silveria, the Consent Calendar was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Bortolazzo, Daley, Healy, Silveria, Strawbridge and Chair Railsback
Noes: None
Absent: None
Abstain: Commissioner Ioakimedes

A. Approval of Agenda

B. Planning Commission Minutes of December 14, 2006

V. REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

A. 1400 EAST SECOND STREET

06PLN-67 Use Permit 06PLN-68 Design Review
1400 East Second Street, APN: 88-083-350

PROPOSAL:

The applicant requests design review and a use permit to install three (3) wireless communications antennas on the existing Heritage Presbyterian Church steeple, with associated mechanical equipment located in ground mounted equipment shelter.

Recommendation: Planning Commission and Historic Preservation Review Commission adopt the proposed resolutions approving design review and the use permit to install three (3) wireless communications antennas on the existing Heritage Presbyterian Church steeple, with associated mechanical equipment located in ground mounted equipment shelter.

Xzandrea Fowler, Associate Planner, gave an overview of the project. An Initial Study was prepared and no comments were received.

Don Wong, Applicant – Thanked staff for their assistance and accepted all of the conditions of approval. He stated that he is available to answer questions.

Chair Railsback noted that the Historic Preservation Review Commission will take action on this project first.

Chair Donaghue noted that the Commission will look at the environmental information and the design information.

There were no questions of staff.

Commissioner Wilson questioned the material for the track and the possibility of running cable within the structure. Don Wong noted that the materials to enclose the cables is a sheet metal that will be painted to match the structure. There is a pitched roof that the cables can't be run through.

Commissioner Delgado questioned how far the encasement will stick out on the top of the building. Don Wong noted that it should either be flush or slightly relieved, no more than 3-4". He noted that the cables are 7" diameter.

The public hearing was opened. No public comment. The public hearing was closed.

RESOLUTION NO. 07-1 (HPRC) - A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF BENICIA APPROVING A DESIGN REVIEW FOR A WIRELESS COMMUNICATION FACILITY AT 1400 EAST SECOND STREET (06PLN-68)

On motion of Commissioner Haughey, seconded by Commissioner Wilson, the above Resolution was adopted by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Dean, Delgado, Haughey, White, Wilson and Chair Donaghue
Noes: None
Absent: Commissioner Conlow

Commissioner Silveria thanked staff for their work on this project.

The public hearing was opened. None. The public hearing was closed.

RESOLUTION NO. 07-1 (PC) - A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF BENICIA APPROVING A USE PERMIT FOR A WIRELESS COMMUNICATION FACILITY LOCATED AT 1400 EAST SECOND STREET (06PLN-67)

On motion of Commissioner Bortolazzo, seconded by Commissioner Strawbridge, the above Resolution was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Bortolazzo, Daley, Healy, Ioakimedes, Silveria,
Strawbridge and Chair Railsback

Noes: None

Absent: None

B. DOWNTOWN/ARSENAL SPECIFIC PLAN

Citywide

PROPOSAL:

Under contract to the City of Benicia, Opticos Design, Inc. has prepared draft General Plan implementation programs for the Downtown and lower Arsenal areas. Drafts of the Downtown Mixed Use Master Plan and the lower Arsenal Mixed Use Specific Plan will be presented for review and discussion. A recommendation from the Planning Commission, incorporating direction for the Historic Preservation Review Commission and the Economic Development Board will be forwarded to the City Council

Recommendation: Planning Commission hold a public hearing to review and recommend City Council adoption of the Downtown and Arsenal Special Plans.

Chair Railsback noted that there are a number of City bodies in attendance. There will be comments on the Downtown Plan first and the Arsenal Plan second.

Commissioner Bortolazzo recused himself from both items.

Commissioners Strawbridge and Ioakimedes recused themselves for the Downtown Plan.

DRAFT DOWNTOWN MIXED USE MASTER PLAN:

Charlie Knox, Community Development Director, noted that only the Planning Commission members will be taking action on these items. The other Board and Commission will be providing input to the Planning Commission.

Charlie Knox stated that he was pleased to see a large turnout. He introduced the Consultants. The Consultants will be making a presentation on the Downtown Plan, and separately on the Arsenal Plan. It is anticipated that the Downtown Plan will require a Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) and the Arsenal Plan will require an Environmental Impact Report (EIR). He commented on the need to clarify measurement of height. There are also issues with setbacks on vacated alleys, which should be clarified.

Stefan Pellegrini, Consultant, gave a presentation on the Downtown Master Plan. He noted that constructive comments have been received from community members. The basis of the Plan is to solidify the mixed-use designation in the General Plan. There is a unique fabric in the community that should be preserved. He gave a brief background of the consulting team. This has been an ongoing public process, including charrettes held in September 2006. He gave background information on specific issues related to Benicia. A presentation of slides was shown. A Regulating Plan has been created to implement the goals of the General Plan.

Chair Railsback gave the Board and Commission an opportunity to ask questions of the consulting team. An opportunity will be given after the public comment as well.

Commissioner Dean stated his appreciation for the work that has gone into this. He questioned height and form-based zoning in relation to the plan. Stefan Pellegrini noted that the team sought to make a recommendation in context of existing zoning. Clarifications can be made prior to adoption of the Plan.

Commissioner Dean questioned how the comments will be incorporated into the Plan prior to City Council adoption. Charlie Knox stated that a recommendation will be made to the City Council with a list of changes requested by the Planning Commission. The goal of the process is to ensure the community's input becomes a set of guidelines for the City Council. This will assist the City in the environmental review of the Plans.

Suzanne Kleiman (EDB) questioned if diagonal parking was considered. Stefan Pellegrini noted that a downtown parking study had been done by the City, which included diagonal parking. There are areas where diagonal parking is appropriate.

Suzanne Kleiman (EDB) questioned parking in relation to ferry service. Stefan Pellegrini noted that parking would be an issue for commuter ferry service.

Toni Haughey (HPRC) commented on the Historic Conservation Plan. She further commented on height of new construction and if design review should be required. Stefan Pellegrini noted that the Plan will create a form of compatibility, however, the design issues will be reviewed by the HPRC.

The public hearing was opened.

Bob Berman, 250 West K Street – He lives and works downtown. He does not believe there is adequate time to review the plan. He stated confusion over the CEQA process and doesn't think approval can be made prior to the environmental work being done. He noted that the Bay Trail is far from complete. He commented on downtown parking and residential parking permits.

Robert Alfandary represents the owners of the Tannery Building. He stated issues with the setbacks and would like to be able to build upwards.

Allan Shore – He commented on the need for businesses to market and promote themselves. There seem to be issues that are not addressed in these types of plans. He stated that there are issues with the local newspaper in promoting local businesses and news.

Jeannie Hamann commented on Chapter 4, page 3. There are issues on the zoning on East G Street. She would like this zoned to Neighborhood General Open.

Jerry Pfau, Business Owner – She stated that she likes the Plan. She is concerned with the lack of availability of retail space. She would like to see more overall promotion of

retail, not just near the waterfront. The Majestic Theater is a vital location. She likes the idea of the ferry, but doesn't know how feasible it is right now.

Laura Ramirez, Business Owner – There are merchants investing money in promoting downtown. She is disappointed with the location of the billboards promoting Benicia. Tourism is important for Benicia.

Sandra Shannonhouse, 110 East E – She stated that there are a number of positive things in the study. There are also some issues with the Plan. There is insufficient time to review the Plan. She is concerned with the construction of large buildings. The small buildings need to be protected. Downtown residents keep the downtown vital. The Historic Plan supercedes the General Plan and the Downtown Plan.

Donnell Rubay, 175 West H Street – She commented that she submitted a memo that was included in the staff report. She commented on the measurement of height and the setbacks of vacated alleys. Onsite parking requirements should be supported, however reducing parking requirements may lead to a parking plan or a residential parking district. She is concerned with height and lot coverage.

Linda Lewis, 282 West I Street – She appreciates the work that has gone into this report and would like more time to review the documents. She commented on diagonal parking and safety issues. The 200 block of West I Street is narrow and not conducive to a Neighborhood Center. She does not like the idea of parking permits.

Laurie Johnson, Business Owner – She complimented the Plan. She understands the importance of architecture. She would like to see the Plan supported by a public relations campaign. Tourism will be an important component to this Plan.

Phyllis Hartzell, 420 West K Street – She would like more time to review the Plan. She questioned how the district was set and whether this is a phased Plan. She is concerned with economic impacts to property owners downtown. She is concerned with ferry parking.

Darryl Rich, 277 West H Street – He commented on the traditional separation of the business and residential areas. He feels that the residents have been neglected in this process. He commented on a petition from the 80s regarding a 24' height limit. Traffic flows need to be considered.

Cynthia Cooper, Cooper's Dollhouse – She stated that there is a good mix of businesses downtown. She encouraged the Commission to have this move forward.

The public hearing was closed.

Mike White (HPRC) noted on 4-2 that it says form-based codes shall not be preempted by other codes (i.e. building codes). He does not believe this is legal. He further noted that there is a need for more time to review this Plan.

Duane Oliveira (EDB) stated that he would like to have more time to review the Plan. The City does not know if ferry service is feasible, so parking issues are only speculation. This will need to be looked at more closely. The Intermodal Transportation Station will also be a factor.

Chris Strawbridge (EDB) is excited about having a vision for downtown. She would like to see something happen and tourism is extremely important.

J.B. Davis (EDB) stated that EDB is updating the Economic Development Plan. He would like to have more time to review this Plan.

Don Dean (HPRC) commented on neighborhood centers. He commented on the focus on First Street. Regarding East 2nd Street, across from AT&T, it might not be conducive to Neighborhood Commercial. Also I Street location might not be conducive to Neighborhood Commercial. He would like more time to review the Plan.

Luis Delgado (HPRC) stated that the Plan will have amendments to it. There needs to be more time to review and amend the Plan.

Pat Donaghue (HPRC) stated that the Historic Conservation Plan will continue to serve as a regulatory document. He commented on the need for the Plan to be consistent with the General Plan.

Commissioner Healy commented on whether this item should be continued. Commissioner Silveria stated that she is not prepared to vote on this tonight.

Commissioner Healy questioned the Specific Plan in relation to the General Plan. Charlie Knox noted that this is to implement the mixed-use zoning designation in the General Plan. He noted that in terms of environmental review, a draft is being recommended, which will allow staff to initiate environmental review.

Charlie Knox noted that single-family residential design review is a policy issue to be considered by City Council. If the Commissions desire, they can make a recommendation to the City Council to look into this.

Regarding the boundary of the area, this is the General Plan Land-Use map boundary.

Charlie Knox noted that this is not solely a code that governs form. There are allowable uses in the Plan.

Regarding height limits, staff recommends maintaining the measurement of height limits. Major changes to height limits might create a number of non-conforming structures.

Commissioner Daley stated that the Plan is detailed and he would like to continue this item for further review. He seconded Commissioner Healy's motion to continue this until Wednesday, January 17th.

Chair Railsback stated that he understands the concerns to continue the meeting. This is not the last step in the process.

Commissioner Silveria stated concerns with the locations of the neighborhood commercial areas. There is a need to extend some of these areas. Stefan Pellegrini stated that this designation was applied to existing areas that had non-residential uses. Commissioner Silveria noted that East G Street should be re-designated on the opposite side of the street as shown. He noted that there was community input to be conservative. Charlie Knox noted that there needs to be consideration to both sides of the street. He further noted that the Commission will make a recommendation of changes to the City Council.

Commissioner Silveria would like to see story poles. Charlie Knox stated that this is a discussion item for HPRC and he will add this as a discussion item at their next meeting.

On motion of Commissioner Healy, seconded by Commissioner Daley, the above item was continued to Wednesday, January 17th by the following vote:

Ayes:	Commissioners Daley, Healy, Silveria, and Chair Railsback
Noes:	None
Absent:	None
Abstain:	Commissioners Bortolazzo, Ioakimedes and Strawbridge

A recess was called at 9:40 p.m. The meeting was reconvened at 9:50 p.m.

Chair Railsback noted that Opticos will make a presentation on the Arsenal and then the public hearing will be opened. He further noted that the meeting will be continued to Wednesday, January 17th.

Charlie Knox noted that the purpose of the documents is to create certainty. Particularly in relation to the Arsenal, there is a need for certainty.

DRAFT LOWER ARSENAL MIXED USE SPECIFIC PLAN:

Commissioners Ioakimedes and Strawbridge rejoined the Commission.

Stefan Pellegrini, Consultant – Gave an overview of the Arsenal Plan. He stated that it's been an honor to create a plan for such an historic area. The Arsenal boundary comprises roughly 50 acres. There is a mix of zoning designations within the Arsenal. The Yuba property was also looked at because it's an important connection between the Arsenal and Downtown. The Jefferson Ridge will be a key component. Areas for improvement related to sub-districts in the conservation plan. Grant Street was mentioned in terms of residential uses. Goals and policies of the Arsenal Conservation Plan were integrated into the Draft Arsenal Plan.

The public hearing was opened.

Mark Hajjar, 1025 Grant Street property owner – He commented on the Guard House and view issues. He further commented on height and mass issues related to the Command Post. His comments had been included in the staff report.

Dennis McCray, Solano Affordable Housing Foundation – He submitted a letter to the Commission. He commented on the Jefferson Ridge Officers' Square between Adams and Jefferson Street. He would like to develop affordable senior housing in that area. He believes there are topographical and economic issues that were not addressed in the plan.

Dana Dean, Attorney – She is representing Amports, which owns the Yuba property. She is happy to see excitement around a project in Benicia. She thanked staff for their enthusiasm and energy. She noted flaws in the plan. This was noticed as a specific plan for the Arsenal, and Yuba was not initially included. Amports would have included more information on the Yuba property. She would like to see the removal of the Yuba property from the document. The plan omits the comfort, health and safety of the citizens. There is an issue with residential zones immediately adjacent to a port. She will be submitting correspondence to the Commission. There is a need for a buffer to protect the residents and businesses.

Laura Knight, Jefferson Street – She reviewed the plan briefly and thinks it's good. She is concerned with a one-way street change on Jefferson Street. There are 7' easements which should be looked into.

Marilyn Bardet, 333 East K Street – She submitted comments to the Commission. She complimented Opticos and staff for formulating this Plan. She believes it will take considerable time to go through this Plan. She commented on the Jefferson Ridge and recommended phased development. She is opposed to piece-mealing the district. She is concerned with building height.

Steve Goetz, 347 Goldenslopes - commented that there are many good ideas in the plan. He would like to see more open space in the plan. He is concerned with the amount of development proposed. Parking can be an issue as well. He would like to see Option 2 deleted from any recommendation that goes to the City Council.

Kitty Griffin, 236 Baker – She commented that the documents contain a lot of information. She is concerned with the Jefferson Ridge and tourism possibilities. Tourism is dependent on maintaining the atmosphere of the existing district.

Belinda Smith, 347 Goldenslopes – She submitted comments on the project. She wants to ensure consistency with General Plan policies. She is concerned with high density in the Arsenal. She is concerned with the term “redevelopment” since she equates that with building demolition. She is concerned with the buildings not having been re-evaluated. There is an opportunity below Grant Street that has been overlooked.

Kathleen Olson, 1025 Grant Street property owner – She submitted a letter from Jimi Dunlop and read it into the record. She commented on Amports' perspective regarding

development of the Arsenal. There are other cities that have successful integration of residential and industrial uses.

Jon Van Landschoot, 175 West H Street – He suggested that the Commission only discuss Downtown next week and the Arsenal the following week.

Marilyn Bardet requested information on the timeframes for hearings. Charlie Knox noted that the consultants are available for another Planning Commission meeting. He suggested a possible reversal of the Arsenal/Downtown items next week. The February 8th Planning Commission meeting will be solely devoted to the Benicia Business Park Draft EIR. The Draft Plans are scheduled to go to the City Council on February 20th.

Written comments can be submitted to staff to be distributed to the Commissions.

The public hearing was closed.

Chair Railsback suggested rebroadcasting the meeting. Gina Eleccion noted that this will be rebroadcast on Tuesday, January 16th at 8:30 a.m.

The suggestion was made to start the January 17th meeting at 6:30 p.m.

VI. COMMUNICATIONS FROM STAFF

Gina Eleccion stated that the January 25th Historic Preservation Review Commission meeting will include a presentation from the State Office of Historic Preservation on preservation incentives. This meeting will be broadcast on Channel 27.

VII. COMMUNICATIONS FROM COMMISSIONERS

Chair Railsback welcomed Commissioner Ioakimedes to the Commission.

VIII. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Railsback adjourned the meeting at 11:01 p.m.