



BENICIA HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

**City Hall Commission Room
Thursday, January 24, 2013
6:30 P.M.**

I. OPENING OF MEETING:

A. Pledge of Allegiance

B. Roll Call of Commissioners

Present: Commissioners Delgado, McKee, Trumbly, Van Landschoot, von Studnitz and Chair Haughey

Absent: Commissioner Berry (unexcused)

Staff Present: Charlie Knox, Community Development Director
Amy Million, Principal Planner/Recording Secretary

C. Reference to Fundamental Rights of Public

II. ADOPTION OF AGENDA:

On a motion of Commissioner McKee, seconded by Commissioner Trumbly, the Agenda was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Delgado, McKee, Trumbly, Van Landschoot, von Studnitz and Chair Haughey

Noes: None

Absent: Commissioner Berry

Abstain: None

III. OPPORTUNITY FOR PUBLIC COMMENT

A. WRITTEN COMMENT

None.

B. PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

IV. CONSENT CALENDAR

Commissioner Delgado moved Item IV. B to the regular calendar.

On a motion of Commissioner Van Landschoot, seconded by Commissioner von Studnitz, the consent calendar, noting the minor corrections to the minutes, was approved by the following vote:

- Ayes: Commissioners Delgado, McKee, Trumbly, Van Landschoot, von Studnitz and Chair Haughey.
- Noes: None
- Absent: Commissioner Berry
- Abstain: None

A. Approval of Minutes of November 15, 2012

V. REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

A. DESIGN REVIEW TO RAISE THE FOUNDATION AND REMOVE EXISTING BRICK VENEER AT 821 EAST SECOND STREET

The Commission requested clarification from the applicant on the reason for removing the brick, the age of the building and if the brick veneer was original to the building. The applicant, Phil Joy, stated that the removal was determined necessary by the structural engineer, the building was constructed in the 1970s and the brick was original to the building.

No public comment.

RESOLUTION NO. 13-1 OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF BENICIA APPROVING EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS TO THE FAÇADE OF 821 EAST SECOND STREET

On a motion of Commissioner Delgado, seconded by Commissioner Trumbly, the above resolution was approved by the following vote:

- Ayes: Commissioners Delgado, McKee, Trumbly, Van Landschoot, von Studnitz and Chair Haughey.
- Noes: None
- Absent: Commissioner Berry
- Abstain: None

B. DESIGN REVIEW TO INCREASE THE HEIGHT OF THE ROOFLINE AT 1209 POLK STREET

Ms. Million provided a brief overview of the project.

Timothy Boe, the applicant, presented the project. Mr. Boe discussed the arsenal area and in response to Commissioner McKee's comment stated that the stucco finish would be similar to concrete.

The Commission requested clarification from the applicant in regard to construction of the quoins, structural integrity of the building with the increased roofline, the ornamentation of the building and the proposed windows. Mr. Boe stated that the quoins will be constructed with a wood frame and covered with stucco, the engineer has verified the structural integrity of the roof change and the windows would match the existing clear anodized windows.

The Commission discussed the design of the building and expressed their desire to have less ornamentation such as a smaller vent/medallion on the Polk Street façade, removal of the quoins and a more simple trim detail. The applicant agreed to the suggested changes.

No public comment.

**RESOLUTION NO. 13-2 OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW
COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF BENICIA APPROVING DESIGN REVIEW FOR
MODIFICATIONS TO THE EXISTING BUILDING AT 1209 POLK STREET**

On a motion of Commissioner Van Landschoot, seconded by Commissioner McKee, the above resolution was amended as follows:

Additional Conditions of Approval:

1. removal of the quoin detailing and use fascia boards
2. smaller trim to be similar to existing trim (instead of crown molding as shown on plans and
3. smooth stucco texture similar to existing industrial buildings in the area

and approved by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners McKee, Trumbly, Van Landschoot, von Studnitz and Chair Haughey
Noes: Commissioner Delgado
Absent: Commissioner Berry
Abstain: None

C. DESIGN REVIEW TO REPLACE ELEVEN WINDOWS AT 283 WEST H STREET

Chair Haughey provided an historic photograph of the interior of the subject property.

Ms. Million provided a brief overview of the project.

Brent Anderson of Renewal by Anderson, the applicant, described the materials and expressed his apologies for completing the work without benefit of a permit.

Public comment was opened.

Winifred Dean, adjacent property owner, asked a question about the process for replacing windows. Mr. Knox explained the options of the Commission for this project are to either approve or disapprove the request. Ms. Dean was encouraged to stay for the next item.

Commissioner McKee inquired about the ability to paint the window material. The applicant confirmed that it was able to be painted. The Commission discussed the existing windows and the consistency of the proposed windows.

RESOLUTION NO. 13-3 OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF BENICIA APPROVING WINDOW REPLACEMENT AT 283 WEST H STREET

On a motion of Commissioner Delgado, seconded by Commissioner McKee, above resolution was amended as follows:

Additional Findings:

4. The building has been significantly altered, including enclosure of the porch and replacement of windows subsequent to the home's period of historic significance. The wood casement windows being replaced are not an original material and are inconsistent with the architectural style of the building, while the proposed double-hung one-over-one windows are appropriate to the Queen Anne cottage style architecture.
5. When wood windows are not used, the proposed paintable wood composite window is a preferable material over other alternative materials such as vinyl.

Additional Conditions of Approval:

1. The applicant is encouraged to consider replacing the front living room window to re-create the original design as shown in the historic photograph marked Exhibit B on file with the Community Development Department.
2. The exterior of the windows shall be painted to match the existing wood window trim.

and approved by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioner Delgado, McKee, Trumbly, Van Landschoot,
von Studnitz and Chair Haughey
Noes: None
Absent: Commissioner Berry
Abstain: None

**D. WINDOW STANDARDS RESOLUTION AND DESIGN REVIEW EXEMPTIONS
DISCUSSION**

Ms. Million provided an introduction to draft changes to the Downtown Historic Conservation Plan to address the previous window standards resolutions adopted by the Commission.

Mr. Knox provided additional information on the purpose of the draft changes. He also informed the Commission of the progress made towards the workshop staff has been working on providing with the joint efforts of the California Preservation Foundation.

The Commission and staff discussed the proposed changes, the window workshop including the process and cost for repairing wood windows and the design review process including the appeal of Commission decisions to the Planning Commission.

Mr. Knox stated that there are several issues to consider before finalizing the changes to the Downtown Historic Conservation Plan such as determining the thresholds for allowing replacement instead of requiring repair.

Staff will take the comments presented and bring back a final draft for Commission action.

VII. COMMUNICATIONS FROM STAFF

A. City Council designation of Commissioners Haughey and Trumbly as “Owners of Historic Property”

Staff informed the Commission that on November 20, 2012, the City Council designated Commissioners Haughey and Trumbly as the “Owners of Historic Property” as required under the Benicia Municipal Code.

VIII. COMMUNICATIONS FROM COMMISSIONERS

Commissioner Van Landschoot thanked staff for working to arrange a window workshop.

IX. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Haughey adjourned the meeting at 8:53 p.m.