



BENICIA HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION

CITY HALL COMMISSION ROOM

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, March 26, 2009

6:30 P.M.

I. OPENING OF MEETING

- A. Pledge of Allegiance**
- B. Roll Call of Commissioners**

Present: Commissioners Donaghue, Haughey, McKee, Taagepera, White and Chair
Mang
Absent: Commissioner Crompton (excused)

Staff Present:

Lisa Porras, Senior Planner
Gina Eleccion, Management Analyst

- C. Reference to Fundamental Rights of Public** - A plaque stating the Fundamental Rights of each member of the public is posted at the entrance to this meeting room per Section 4.04.030 of the City of Benicia's Open Government Ordinance.

II. AGENDA CHANGES AND DISCUSSION

None.

III. OPPORTUNITY FOR PUBLIC COMMENT

- A. WRITTEN**
None.

- B. PUBLIC COMMENT**

Bonnie Silveria, Benicia Historical Society – Requested an agenda item to discuss the possibility of having a standing committee between the HPRC and Historical Society.

IV. CONSENT CALENDAR

Commissioner Taagepera requested that Item IV-B be pulled for discussion.

On motion of Commissioner Donaghue, seconded by Commissioner White, the Consent Calendar was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Donaghue, Haughey, McKee, Taagepera, White and Chair Mang
Noes: None
Absent: Commissioner Crompton (excused)
Abstain: None

A. Approval of Agenda

B. Approval of Minutes of February 26, 2009

Commissioner Taagepera noted that the Commission had requested a definition of minor vs. repair and that is not reflected in the minutes. In addition, Commissioner Taagepera requested additional clarification regarding the CLG commissioner qualifications. Under Communications from Commissioners, the first two items were discussed and the third and fourth will be agendized at a future meeting. Commissioner White requested clarification on his recommendation that Steve McKee work with Bonnie Silveria to identify the historic elements of the Tannery.

On motion of Commissioner White, seconded by Commissioner Donaghue, the Minutes of February 26, 2009 were approved, as amended, by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Donaghue, Haughey, McKee, Taagepera, White and Chair Mang
Noes: None
Absent: Commissioner Crompton (excused)
Abstain: None

V. REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

A. 250 WEST H STREET - ADDITION TO EXISTING SINGLE FAMILY DETACHED DWELLING UNIT

09PLN-5 Design Review
250 West H Street, APN: 089-111-040

PROPOSAL:

The applicant requests design review approval to expand an existing residential building from 2,318 to 3,317 square feet. The applicant proposes to construct an additional 999 square feet at the rear of the building in order to: (1) enlarge the basement; (2) add a new bedroom, bathroom, and sitting room on the first floor, (3) add a bathroom, recreation room and office to the second story. This project is located within the Downtown Historic District and listed as a Contributing Building, thereby subject to the Downtown Historic Conservation Plan (DHCP) guidelines for Historic Buildings for residential building types.

Recommendation: Approve a 999 square foot addition to the property at 250 West H Street, based on the findings and subject to the conditions in the proposed resolution.

Commissioner McKee, as the architect for the project, recused himself. Commissioner Taagepera recused herself due to property ownership within 500' of the project. Commissioner Taagepera stated she would like to remain in the room to hear the discussion. Commissioners commented that the Rules and Procedures do not allow it. There was a request to have all meetings televised. Gina Eleccion noted that the City Attorney advised Commissioners to leave the room. If Commissioners choose to stay it is at their own risk. Commissioner Taagepera left the room.

Lisa Porras, Senior Planner, gave an overview of the project. Not only is an addition proposed, but modifications to the windows, chimney, and installation of skylights are also proposed. She noted an error in Condition #1 of the resolution. This should read sheets 1-4.

Commissioners commented on the windows in the plans. In addition, they noted that no DPR form was included in the packet. There are concerns with the windows and skylights. Lisa Porras gave specific information on the existing windows and doors. The applicant will repair the existing, and replace with Marvin, if not possible to repair.

Mallory Wilkerson – She gave a brief history of the property and the project.

The public hearing was opened.

Jon Van Landschoot, 175 West H Street – He noted that he would like full-sized plans available. He would also like to see story poles used to demonstrate the height and massing of the structure. He has concerns with the materials proposed. The front window adds a design feature that was not there. The skylights should not be visible from the street. The windows and doors should all be consistent. The removal of the chimney is an issue, unless it's for safety reasons. He has concerns with the square footage being added.

The public hearing was closed.

Gina Eleccion noted that staff intended to post full-sized plans, but the set is missing from the file. Staff will continue to provide full-sized plans for the public.

Commissioners discussed the project. The issue of skylights visible from the street was raised. There have been projects proposed where the skylights were not approved. The Commission has looked at Marvin double-hung windows in the past. There are concerns with the addition of the front window, particularly the shape of the window. Commissioners commented on retaining the chimney. If the windows and doors are going to be replaced, they should be consistent. Commissioners suggested painting the skylight flashing the same color as the roof. Regarding the fireplace, there are issues with reinforcing the existing material.

Amend conditions:

1. Exclude arched window.
2. Paint skylight flashing the same color as roofing.
3. All replacement windows shall be consistent in design with materials proposed. If divided lites are proposed, they must be true-divided lites.
4. Commissioner Donaghue noted that the incandescent light proposed must either be on a timer or motion-sensored. He would like it to be dark-sky compliant.

RESOLUTION NO. 09-7 A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF BENICIA APPROVING DESIGN REVIEW FOR A 999 SQUARE FOOT ADDITION TO AN EXISTING SINGLE-FAMILY BUILDING LOCATED AT 250 WEST H STREET

On motion of Commissioner White, seconded by Commissioner Donaghue, the above Resolution, as amended, was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Donaghue, Haughey, White and Chair Mang
Noes: None
Absent: Commissioner Crompton
Abstain: Commissioners McKee and Taagepera

A recess was called at 6:38 p.m. The meeting was reconvened at 6:45 p.m.

B. COMMISSION RULES & PROCEDURES

The Commission will discuss current Rules and Procedures and, if necessary, adopt changes.

Recommendation: Discuss, review, take public testimony, and amend rules and procedures.

Gina Eleccion, Management Analyst, gave an introduction and overview of this item. She noted that it's important to review and update these Rules and Procedures, but even more important to conduct business based on these rules.

Jon Van Landschoot, 175 West H Street – He commented on the story pole issue. Regarding procedures, he would like to see a defined percentage of increase that would deem something non-historic. He noted that all decisions should be made with the Mills Act in mind.

The public hearing was closed.

Commissioners commented on the priority list of items. The use of Robert's Rules of Order was discussed. There should be clearer rules for electing officers. Commissioners

commented on the informality of some of its actions. Customer service should be the priority.

Gina Eleccion noted that there's a difference between an informal process vs. an unstructured process. The Commission can provide good customer service while running a structured, professional meeting.

Commissioners commented that they liked the informal process, but could be more structured. Commissioners like the idea of workshops when it will assist applicants in redesigning our projects.

Commissioners reviewed the existing Rules and Procedures and made recommendations for changes. The Commission directed Gina Eleccion to bring back a draft document with their recommended changes.

VI. COMMUNICATIONS FROM STAFF

Gina Eleccion noted that the historic resource inventory was adopted. Staff is focusing on outreach and applying for a CLG Grant. She further noted that May is National Preservation Month and she is working on promoting this. She noted that there is an Arsenal Specific Plan meeting on April 6th. There is also a Strategic Plan meeting on March 30th.

VII. COMMUNICATIONS FROM COMMISSIONERS

Commissioners questioned the status of the IOOF building. Gina Eleccion noted that Carol Roland is now working for a private firm and is not available to take on this project. Staff is following up on this issue. Commissioner Haughey commented on the possibility of sealing the building. She will get quotes and bring the information to staff.

Commissioners commented that they liked 11 x 17 plans rather than full sets.

Commissioner Taagepera commented on Bonnie Silveria's suggestion of a standing subcommittee. Consensus of the Commission was to agendaize this item. Commissioner Taagepera questioned if the demolition ordinance is on an April Council agenda. In addition, she would like staff to follow up on trainings they attend, and provide information to the Commission. She noted there is a sign program. Gina Eleccion confirmed this is an Economic Development program. In addition, she noted that the Building Department is requiring lighted address signs. Staff will follow up with the Building Department on what the requirements are.

Commissioner Taagepera commented on the memo she submitted. Consensus of the Commission was to add this to the list of discussion items.

Chair Mang commended Gina Eleccion and Bonnie Silveria for their presentations at the March 27th Council meeting.

VIII. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Mang adjourned the meeting at 9:40 p.m.