



**BENICIA HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES**

**City Hall Commission Room
Thursday, September 18, 2014
6:30 P.M.**

I. OPENING OF MEETING

A. Pledge of Allegiance

B. Roll Call of Commissioners

Present: Commissioners Haughey, McKee, Trumbly (arrived 8:05 p.m.) Van Landschoot, von Studnitz, and Chair Delgado

Absent: None

Staff Present: Dan Marks, Interim Community Development Director
Suzanne Thorsen, Associate Planner
Amy Million, Principal Planner/Recording Secretary

C. Reference to Fundamental Rights of Public

II. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

On a motion of Commissioner Van Landschoot, seconded by Commissioner Haughey, the Agenda was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Haughey, McKee, Van Landschoot, von Studnitz, and Chair Delgado

Noes: None

Absent: Commissioner Trumbly

Abstain: None

III. OPPORTUNITY FOR PUBLIC COMMENT

A. WRITTEN COMMENT

None

B. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

IV. CONSENT CALENDAR

On a motion of Commissioner von Studnitz, seconded by Commissioner Haughey, the Consent Calendar was approved by the following vote:

- Ayes: Commissioners Haughey, McKee, Van Landschoot, von Studnitz, and Chair Delgado
- Noes: None
- Absent: Commissioner Trumbly
- Abstain: None

A. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF AUGUST 28, 2014 REGULAR MEETING

V. REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

A. DESIGN REVIEW REQUEST TO LEGALIZE THE REPLACEMENT OF THREE WOOD WINDOWS WITH VINYL CLAD OVER WOOD WINDOWS AT 181 WEST H STREET

14PLN-00054 Design Review
181 West H Street
APN 0089-044-21

Ms. Thorsen provided a brief presentation on the project.

The Commission discussed the letter that was submitted by Leann Taagepera via email on September 18, 2014.

Monica Wiley of Paul Davis Restoration spoke on behalf of the applicant and provided background on the window replacement project stating that vinyl clad over wood windows were selected to match the existing vinyl window on the front façade. The applicant inquired about vinyl windows on other homes along the street.

Kim Osburn, property owner, inquired about the Mills Act program.

No public comment.

Commissioner Haughey spoke on the history of window replacements in the area. Commissioner McKee commented on the importance of craftsmanship for replacement windows.

The Commission requested clarification on which windows are subject to the proposed request.

RESOLUTION NO. 14-8 OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF BENICIA DENYING A DESIGN REVIEW FOR REPLACEMENT OF WINDOWS AT 181 WEST H STREET (14PLN-00038)

On a motion of Commissioner Haughey, seconded by Commissioner von Studnitz, the above Resolution was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Haughey, McKee, von Studnitz, and Chair Delgado
Noes: None
Absent: Commissioner Trumbly
Abstain: Commissioner Van Landschoot

Ms. Thorsen provided information to the applicant on the next steps in the process. The applicant indicated that she wanted information on the history of window replacements on the block. Staff directed her to come into the Community Development Department during regular business hours to obtain permit history.

B. MILLS ACT CONTRACT FOR 153 WEST G STREET, AFTER DETERMINATION THAT THE PROJECT IS EXEMPT FROM CEQA

14PLN-00033 Mills Act
153 West G Street
APN: 0089-113-16

Ms. Thorsen provided a brief presentation of the project.

The Commission asked various questions on the proposed work plan and the schedule.

Aud Olsen, presented the proposed work plan and provided additional details on the projects.

The Commission requested information on the windows, the property owner's history with the residence, the timeline, materials and style of the rear door.

Ryan Houseman requested clarification on the ability to re-order work plan items once the contract is approved.

Public comment closed.

The Commission discussed the timing of the work plan. Staff provided clarification on the development of a work plan and the process for conducting annual Mills Act inspections.

Staff provided additional detail on the property based on the historic survey.

The Commission discussed the work plan and the timing of each item. They discussed starting the work plan in 2016, replacing the cement walkway, replacement of the aluminum window and rear door.

RESOLUTION NO. 14-9 OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF BENICIA RECOMMENDING CITY COUNCIL AUTHORIZE THE CITY MANAGER TO ENTER INTO A MILLS ACT CONTRACT FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 153 WEST G STREET

On a motion of Commissioner McKee, seconded by Commissioner Haughey, the above Resolution was approved with the following changes:

1. Addition of a new work item in 2017 to replace the garden window with a traditional window appropriate to the architectural style of the building subject to approval by Planning Division staff.
2. Modify the 2019 work plan item to state "Replace the existing concrete walkway that presently allows water to the foundation. Install drainage to City standards for the downspouts immediately adjacent to the walkway. Proposed repair shall be evaluated by City Staff (Building Inspection Division)."
3. Modify the 2021 work plan items to add that the window replacement is subject to approval by Planning Division staff.
4. Modify the 2023 work plan item add that replacement of the rear door requires review and approval by the Historic Preservation Review Commission.

by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Haughey, McKee, von Studnitz, and Chair Delgado
Noes: None
Absent: Commissioner Trumbly
Abstain: Commissioner Van Landschoot

Chair Delgado recessed the meeting for a 10-minute break at 7:39 p.m.

C. MILLS ACT CONTRACT FOR 180 WEST H STREET, AFTER DETERMINATION THAT THE PROJECT IS EXEMPT FROM CEQA

14PLN-00040 Mills Act
180 West H Street
APN: 0089-113-03

Ms. Thorsen provided a brief presentation on the project.

The property owner provided a presentation on the project and additional details on the house and the work plan items.

The Commission discussed the work plan including the windows and chimney repair.

No public comment.

The Commission discussed the work plan, specifically the replacement of the porch railings, the stair railings near the sidewalk, replacement of the front door, restoration of the chimney

RESOLUTION NO. 14-10 OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF BENICIA RECOMMENDING CITY COUNCIL AUTHORIZE THE CITY MANAGER TO ENTER INTO A MILLS ACT CONTRACT FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 180 WEST H STREET

On a motion of Commissioner Haughey, seconded by Commissioner McKee, the above Resolution was approved with the following changes:

1. Add new work plan item in 2015 “Replace front door with historically appropriate door subject to staff evaluation”.
2. Modify the 2016 work plan item to state “Replace front porch railings with historically appropriate railings subject to review by the Historic Preservation Review Commission”.
3. Add new work plan item, “Replace non-original windows in the sunroom (non-original porch on east façade) with historically appropriate windows to match the existing original window”.
4. Add new work plan item, “Repair the counter weights in the double-hung windows”.

by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Haughey, McKee, von Studnitz, and Chair Delgado
Noes: None
Absent: Commissioner Trumbly
Abstain: Commissioner Van Landschoot

D. DISCUSSION ITEM – DESIGN REVIEW IN HISTORIC DISTRICTS

Ms. Thorsen provided an overview of the discussion item and stated this item was presented before the full Commission to establish a sub-committee to develop a written request to City Council.

Chair Delgado provided a clarification on the purpose of the sub-

committee for those who were not in attendance during the August meeting.

The Commission and staff briefly discussed the design review process, the content of the request before City Council, information to be included into the request including staff time, the type of application, and current policies.

Commissioner Van Landchoot stated he was interested in being in the subcommittee.

Commissioner Haughey and Commissioner McKee also expressed interest.

Commission clarified that the subcommittee could look at the design review process outside of the downtown historic district.

With consensus from the Commission, Chair Delgado appointed Commissioners Haughey, McKee and Van Landschoot to the subcommittee.

VI. COMMUNICATIONS FROM STAFF

Ms. Thorsen informed the Commission of the 2015-2023 Housing Element update and two related text amendments scheduled for public hearing at the October 9, 2014 Planning Commission.

VII. COMMUNICATIONS FROM COMMISSIONERS

Commissioner Haughey questioned the process for enforcement of vinyl windows that were installed 2 years ago without a permit. Staff confirmed the City enforces on a complaint basis.

Commission von Studitz requested clarification on the numbering of the agenda. Staff confirmed it was a typo.

Chair Delgado commended staff for work on a recent project and thanked staff for their hard work.

VIII. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Delgado adjourned the meeting at 8:36 p.m.