



BENICIA HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION

BENICIA UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT – 350 EAST K STREET

****SPECIAL LOCATION****

Meeting will be televised on Cable Channel 28

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, September 25, 2008

6:30 P.M.

I. CALL TO ORDER

A. Pledge of Allegiance

B. Roll Call of Commissioners

Present: Commissioners Crompton, Donaghue, Haughey, McKee, Taagepera, White
and Chair Mang

Absent: None

Staff Present:

Charlie Knox, Community Development Director

Gina Eleccion, Management Analyst

Guests: Bonnie Silveria, Benicia Historical Society

Carol Roland, Consultant

C. Reference to Fundamental Rights of Public - A plaque stating the Fundamental Rights of each member of the public is posted at the entrance to this meeting room per Section 4.04.030 of the City of Benicia's Open Government Ordinance.

II. OPPORTUNITY FOR PUBLIC COMMENT

A. WRITTEN

B. PUBLIC COMMENT

A citizen spoke regarding non-historic design review. He would like to know what guidelines will be followed regarding the non-historic properties. He recommended that fees be waived for non-optional building and repair.

III. CONSENT CALENDAR

On motion of Commissioner White, seconded by Commissioner Donaghue, the Consent Calendar was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Crompton, Donaghue, Haughey, McKee, Taagepera, White and
Chair Mang
Noes: None
Absent: None
Abstain: None

A. Approval of Agenda

IV. REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

A. DRAFT HISTORIC RESOURCE INVENTORY UPDATE

City of Benicia
Downtown Historic Conservation District

PROPOSAL:

The City of Benicia is in the process of updating the Downtown Historic Conservation Plan. A current survey of historic properties has been completed and reviewed by an ad hoc committee of volunteers from the Historic Preservation Review Commission and the Benicia Historic Society. A draft of the survey results is being presented to the Commission and public for their review, comment and recommendation to the City Council.

Recommendation: Planning Commission and City Council amend the Downtown Historic Conservation Plan (DHCP) based on the findings, and subject to the conditions listed in the proposed resolution.

Charlie Knox introduced the project. He thanked the committee for their time and effort on this project.

Gina Eleccion gave an overview of the project. She introduced Bonnie Silveria, as a member of the committee.

Bonnie Silveria gave an overview of the project. She discussed the issue regarding the Portuguese community. She recommends we move forward with the survey and deal with the Portuguese homes issue once a context is developed.

Carol Roland noted that the context we have primarily addresses architecture under National Register Criterion C. That was the focus of the survey update.

Kerry Carney, Benicia Historical Society – She owns a property on the 100 block of East H Street and had questions as to the recommendations on that block. She commented on existing properties and their designation status. She commented on her experience with her own historic property.

Linda Lewis, 282 West I Street – She thanked the Commission for their work. She submitted a letter for review. She does not want her residences at 282 West I and 401 West J included as contributors.

Doug Robertson, 532 East J Street – Spoke requesting 405 East H Street be added to the district as a resource.

Larry Miller, Benicia Historical Society – He thanked everyone for their work on this project. He believes the integrity exists in the properties the committee is recommending as contributing buildings. He commented on the continued need to review homes that are over 50 years old for possible inclusion.

Kathleen Olson, 920 First Street – She thanked the committee and staff for their work on this project. She believes there was some subjectivity in the process. She read letters into the record regarding 130 West E and 251 West G. She commented on the construction date as prior to 1942. Carol Roland noted that there is a 1913-1942 Sanborn map. She noted that in that period of time, Sanborn began revising their old maps, and this property was on the 1913-1942 map, which notes construction within that time period.

Property owner 156 West F– He stated there is incorrect information on the form. He commented on work that has been done to the property. He does not think the design review fee is fair.

Donnell Rubay – She thanked the Committee for their work and noted her husband could not be here to make his comments. She is pleased with what has been done. She believes we need to look at design guidelines for non-historic properties to be compatible with the historic properties.

Marleen Deane, 1121 West 2nd Street – She questioned if there will be additional time to discuss this. She believes there should be consideration for individual properties and how they are used. She commented on materials and conditions of properties.

Steve Stark 396 East H – He commented on context. He does not see how it affects the structure.

Robert Reichert, 710 First Street – He would like his property to remain as a contributor, not be elevated to a landmark.

The public hearing was closed. A recess was called at 8:05 p.m. The meeting was reconvened at 8:15 p.m.

Chair Mang requested that Carol Roland and Bonnie Silveria comment on the specific properties brought up under public comment. Staff noted that Commissioners will need to recuse themselves on specific properties they have a conflict of interest on.

155/157 East H Street – no additional discussion needed.

138 East H – address will be added to DPR form and designation spreadsheet.

130 West E (Donaghue recused) – Carol Roland noted the date of construction was based on the 1913-1942 Sanborn map. In terms of historic appearance, additional information would need to be found should a proposal be made for restoration. Regarding Criterion C, this is one of the few industrial type buildings in the downtown. The form notes some issues with integrity, but it is still representative of its industrial building type. Charlie Knox noted that if this building was not designated as historic, as it's a commercial structure, it would still need full design review approval. Bonnie Silveria commented on the lack of industrial buildings and believes this structure should be retained. Commissioners discussed the architecture of 130 West E. There is concern that this building could be demolished. There are ways to adaptively reuse the building. Charlie Knox noted that no demolition ordinance has been drafted, which means no historic properties currently can be demolished per the Downtown Master Plan Negative Declaration.

251 West G (Haughey/Taagepera recused) – Commissioners commented on the integrity of the property. Bonnie Silveria noted that it has not changed in its footprint, but the window and porch have been changed. Carol Roland recommends removal of this property. Commissioner McKee commented on the properties that are “marginal,” and that they would still be subject to design review. Charlie Knox noted that this home is much smaller than its neighbors.

165 West F – No additional comments from Commission. Carol Roland stated that the description is based on looking at the house from the street. Additional documentation can be provided and the form modified as necessary.

710 First – Property owner would like this to be a contributor, not a designated landmark. Carol Roland noted this property might be considered a landmark, but there are issues with integrity. Consensus was to designate as a contributor.

282 West I (Haughey/Taagepera recused) – no questions.

401 West J (Haughey/Donaghue recused) – no questions.

405 East H –Commission determined not to amend the district boundary to include. Home recently was remodeled, including major addition.

110 East E – (Donaghue recused). There was discussion about the integrity, and the association with Robert Arneson is appropriate for 402 West J, not this structure, according to the property owner. Commission agreed to delist.

811 East 6th – No questions.

Properties outside current boundary:

385 West K – (Donaghue recused) Commissioners discussed this property. Carol Roland noted that she was asked to see if there were any additional districts or boundaries that should be designated. Commissioners commented on what the original features were.

327 Gull Point Court – (Taagepera recused) – Commissioners agree.

470 West J – no questions.

690 West K – no questions.

602 West K – The committee discussed this. Carol Roland noted that either a property contributes to a district or does not. This is based on the California Register criteria. Commissioner Taagepera noted there could be “properties of merit,” as a property outside the district.

It was clarified that the Fire Museum on East 2nd Street should be removed from the designation list.

Commissioners discussed the removal of properties and the impact on the district. Carol Roland noted that based on the high number of historic properties, the district is still substantial in its historic integrity.

Questions were asked about changing the district boundaries and whether intervening non-historic properties should also be added to due concern that there is no design review for the non-historic properties adjacent to the district boundaries. Carol Roland noted that by adding non-contributing structures, you lower the percentage of designated structures.

Commissioner Donaghue asked if he would have the opportunity to speak on 141 East E Street. Charlie Knox noted that there would be opportunity in the future.

Commissioners did not reach a consensus on the following two properties, and these were voted on individually as noted below:

130 West E

On motion of Commissioner Crompton, seconded by Commissioner Haughey, the property is recommended to remain as a contributing structure in the Downtown Historic Overlay District by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Crompton, Haughey, Taagepera
Noes: Commissioner McKee, White and Chair Mang
Absent: None
Abstain: Commissioner Donaghue

251 West G

On motion of Commissioner White, seconded by Commissioner Donaghue, the property is recommended to be removed as a contributing structure in the Downtown Historic Overlay District by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Donaghue, McKee, White and Mang
Noes: Commissioner Crompton
Absent: None
Abstain: Commissioners Haughey and Taagepera

Commissioner Donaghue asked to recuse himself to speak on his property at 141 East E Street. Chair Mang and Staff advised him that the public hearing was closed. Staff clarified that they were referring to Planning Commission and City Council when responding that Commissioner Donaghue would have an opportunity to speak on this item in the future.

Modifications to below resolution:

1. Change 710 First Street to “contributor”
2. 385 West K not recommended for designation or inclusion in the district
3. Change 110 East E Street to “remove”
4. Regarding Portuguese-influenced properties (as noted in Ad Hoc Committee report), support Roland-Nawi recommendation for removal. Issue of Portuguese will be addresses with the development of a historic context. All properties within the Downtown Historic Overlay District, excluding those in the Eastern Residential Area (shown on page 8 of the DHCP) and any other future exclave of the Central Historic Area (shown on page 7 of the DHCP) are now subject to non-historic design review.

RESOLUTION NO. 08-8 (HPRC) - A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF BENICIA TO THE CITY COUNCIL REGARDING THE DOWNTOWN HISTORIC DISTRICT SURVEY AND THE UPDATE TO THE DOWNTOWN HISTORIC CONSERVATION PLAN

On motion of Commissioner White, seconded by Commissioner Haughey, the above Resolution was adopted, with exceptions as noted and abstentions shown in Exhibit A attached to the Resolution, by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Crompton, Donaghue, Haughey, McKee, Taagepera, White
and Chair Mang
Noes: None
Absent: None
Abstain: None

V. COMMUNICATIONS FROM COMMISSIONERS

Commissioner Haughey acknowledged Gina Eleccion for her work on this project.

VI. COMMUNICATIONS FROM STAFF

Gina Eleccion noted that there will be a Housing Expo on October 3rd and 4th at the Veterans' Memorial building. Flyers are available for the Commission and public.

In addition, there will be a presentation of the Climate Action Plan at the October 9th Planning Commission meeting, and a Climate Action workshop at the November 13th Planning Commission meeting.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Mang adjourned the meeting at 10:45 p.m.