



**BENICIA HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION  
CITY HALL COMMISSION ROOM**

**REGULAR MEETING MINUTES**

**Thursday, November 15, 2007  
6:30 P.M.**

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

**A. Pledge of Allegiance**

**B. Roll Call of Commissioners**

Present: Commissioners Conlow, Donaghue, Haughey, Mang and White  
Absent: Commissioner Wilson and Chair Delgado (both excused)

Staff Present:

Damon Golubics, Senior Planner  
Lisa Porras, Senior Planner  
Mike Marcus, Assistant Planner  
Gina Eleccion, Management Analyst

**C. Reference to Fundamental Rights of Public - A plaque stating the Fundamental Rights of each member of the public is posted at the entrance to this meeting room per Section 4.04.030 of the City of Benicia's Open Government Ordinance.**

**II. OPPORTUNITY FOR PUBLIC COMMENT**

**A. WRITTEN**

None.

**B. PUBLIC COMMENT**

Jon Van Landschoot, 175 West H Street – Spoke regarding the Mills Act program. He is concerned about the City's follow-up. He is concerned with a double standard being applied with the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation.

**III. CONSENT CALENDAR**

Commissioner Donaghue pulled Item III-B for discussion. Commissioner Mang pulled Item III-E for discussion. Commissioner Haughey pulled Items III-C and III-D, and stated that she does not believe Mills Act contracts should be on the Consent Calendar.

On motion of Commissioner White, seconded by Commissioner Mang, the Consent Calendar, as amended, was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Conlow, Donaghue, Haughey, Mang and White  
Noes: None  
Absent: Commissioner Wilson and Chair Delgado  
Abstain: Commissioner Donaghue (Item III-E); Commissioner Haughey (Item III-D)

**A. Approval of Agenda**

**B. Approval of Minutes of October 25, 2007**

Commissioner Donaghue requested a change to Page 6. Condition #1 should read “Delete the reference to clad”.

Commissioner Mang requested additional information on the recommendation on 126 East E Street. Gina Eleccion will revise the minutes and bring them back to the next meeting.

**C. 171 WEST H STREET – MILLS ACT CONTRACT – Public Hearing  
07PLN-75 APN: 89-044-190**

**PROPOSAL:**

The applicant requests approval of a Mills Act Contract with the City of Benicia for this property.

**Recommendation:** Approve Mills Act contract and recommend City Council approval.

Commissioner Haughey commented that she does not want to see Mills Act contracts on the Consent Calendar.

Mike Marcus, Assistant Planner, gave a brief overview of the proposed Mills Act contract. He noted that refacing the garage and the windows are the most substantial items on the contract.

The public hearing was opened.

William Venturelli, Applicant – He spoke regarding the windows and would like to put a larger window. In addition, he commented that some of the previous improvements were poorly done.

Jon Van Landschoot, 175 West H Street – He supports approval of this contract. He suggested working with staff regarding the window size.

The public hearing was closed.

Commissioners discussed the proposal. Commissioners requested expert opinion regarding consistency with the Standards for Rehabilitation. The Commission suggested alternatives to the windows. Commissioner Haughey noted that the current DPR form deems the property historic.

White – approve as written, with changes of window and porch to come back for design review approval. Haughey – second. Commissioners would like an expert opinion. Haughey withdrew her second. Conlow – second. Commissioner Haughey commented that on previous applications, staff has been allowed to accept the design review changes.

Gina Eleccion reminded the Commission that it is their purview to make decisions on the consistency with the standards.

Mike Marcus clarified that the work program does not call out changes to the porch other than dry rot repair and porch repair.

Final conditions:

1. Approve Mills Act contract, as written, and recommended by staff, with any changes to existing structure brought back to HPRC with recommendation/evaluation of historic expert for approval.

**RESOLUTION NO. 07- 24 (HPRC) - A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF BENICIA RECOMMENDING CITY COUNCIL AUTHORIZE THE CITY MANAGER TO ENTER INTO A MILLS ACT CONTRACT FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 171 WEST H STREET**

On motion of Commissioner White, seconded by Commissioner Conlow, the above Resolution, as amended, was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Conlow, Donaghue, Mang and White  
Noes: Commissioner Haughey  
Absent: Commissioner Wilson and Chair Delgado  
Abstain: None

**D. 270 WEST H STREET – MILLS ACT CONTRACT – Public Hearing**  
07PLN-77 APN: 89-111-020

**PROPOSAL:**

The applicant requests approval of a Mills Act Contract with the City of Benicia for this property.

**Recommendation:** Approve Mills Act contract and recommend City Council approval.

Commissioner Haughey stated that she had to recuse herself due to financial interest within the past 12 months.

The public hearing was opened.

Lisa Porras, Senior Planner, gave a brief overview of the proposal.

The public hearing was opened.

Leann Taagepera, Applicant – She commented that Lisa Porras made good suggestions regarding her work program. She asked for clarification if her lot is both 271 West G and 270 West H.

Jon Van Landschoot, 175 West H Street – He supports approval of the contract.

**RESOLUTION NO. 07-25- (HPRC) - A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF BENICIA RECOMMENDING CITY COUNCIL AUTHORIZE THE CITY MANAGER TO ENTER INTO A MILLS ACT CONTRACT FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 270 WEST H STREET**

On motion of Commissioner Conlow, seconded by Commissioner White, the above Resolution was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Conlow, Donaghue, Mang and White  
Noes: None  
Absent: Commissioner Wilson and Chair Delgado  
Abstain: Commissioner Haughey

**E. 441 WEST J STREET – MILLS ACT CONTRACT – Public Hearing**  
07PLN-82 APN: 87-152-150

**PROPOSAL:**

The applicant requests approval of a Mills Act Contract with the City of Benicia for this property.

**Recommendation:** Approve Mills Act contract and recommend City Council approval.

Commissioner Donaghue stated he had a conflict of interest due to property ownership within 500' of the project.

Lisa Porras, Senior Planner, gave a brief overview of the proposal. She noted items on the work program. New work will be differentiated from the existing.

Commissioners questioned how the siding will be done. Lisa Porras deferred this question to the applicant.

The public hearing was opened.

James Coleman, Applicant – He gave an overview of the property. There is an addition to the property. He would like to extend the look of the original siding, with demarcation, to continue the linear look of the property. He would like to put the tall, narrow windows in the back. He would like to put wood, divided 6 over 6 windows.

Jon Van Landschoot, 175 West H Street – He supports this and appreciates when property owners replace their aluminum windows with wood.

The public hearing was closed.

Commissioners discussed the windows on the back of the property. The applicant noted that it would be difficult to stay with the existing window openings. Commissioners questioned the use of 6 over 6 and would like to ensure consistency with the Greek Revival architecture. The applicant shall provide the appropriate documentation to staff prior to a building permit being issued.

Commissioners commented on the sequence of the work to be done. James Coleman noted that the aluminum door is deteriorated and the windows would be done at the same time. Commissioner Mang would like to switch items 2 and 3 in the work program.

Final conditions:

1. Replacement window style be verified by staff, prior to building permit issuance.
2. Reverse the order of items 2 and 3 in the work plan.

**RESOLUTION NO. 07-26 (HPRC) - A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF BENICIA RECOMMENDING CITY COUNCIL AUTHORIZE THE CITY MANAGER TO ENTER INTO A MILLS ACT CONTRACT FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 441 WEST J STREET**

On motion of Commissioner Haughey, seconded by Commissioner Conlow, the above Resolution was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Conlow, Haughey, Mang and White  
Noes: None  
Absent: Commissioner Wilson and Chair Delgado  
Abstain: Commissioner Donaghue

**IV. REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS**

**A. 242 WEST I STREET – DESIGN REVIEW AND MILLS ACT CONTRACT**

07PLN-87 Design Review and 07PLN-81 Mills Act Contract  
242 West I Street, APN: 89-042-190

**PROPOSAL**

The applicant requests approval for exterior modifications to the existing single-family residence located at 242 West I Street within the Downtown Historic District. The modifications include foundation repair and leveling, front porch re-construction, shed conversion, rear deck construction, window treatments, and architectural detailing. The applicant also requests approval of a Mills Act Contract with the City of Benicia for this property.

**Recommendation:** Approve design review for exterior alterations to the existing single-family residence, based on the findings, and subject to the conditions listed in the proposed resolution.

**Recommendation:** Approve Mills Act contract and recommend City Council approval.

Commissioner Haughey stated that she had to recuse herself from this item due to property ownership within 500' of the project. Commissioner Donaghue rejoined the meeting

Mike Marcus, Associate Planner, gave a brief presentation. This project includes work that has been performed and work to be performed. He noted that the applicant submitted revised plans dated November 7, 2007.

The public hearing was opened.

Tom DiStefano, Applicant – He commented on the proposal. There is work underway that he would like included in the work program.

Gina Eleccion noted that to be consistent, existing work has not been included on the work programs.

Michael Navas, 224 West I Street – He commented on the effort put forth by this property owner. He supports the proposal.

Leann Taagepera, 270 West H Street – She thinks the property owners are doing a great job. She questioned the gutters and whether they need a permit.

The public hearing was closed.

Commissioners discussed the design review portion of the application. The siding was discussed, as well as the skylights. Mike Marcus clarified that there are two sets of skylights. The staff report reflected this design element.

Staff is recommending trim band to differentiate the construction.

Commissioners discussed the shed and supports that modification.

Commissioner would like design of skylight so that it vents without opening upward. Applicant noted that it is necessary for the skylight to open. He is willing to work with staff to install a skylight that vents without opening. Eyebrow vents were suggested, but the applicant does not think they are sufficient. The applicant would like to provide adequate ventilation without visibility from the street.

The skylight can be brought back to the Commission for approval. Commissioner Conlow commented on skylights.

Final conditions:

3. Condition #6 to reflect approval of 1x10 siding.
4. All other conditions per plans dated November 7<sup>th</sup>, unless otherwise noted.

**RESOLUTION NO. 07-27 (HPRC) - A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF BENICIA APPROVING DESIGN REVIEW PERMIT FOR THE EXTERIOR ALTERATIONS TO THE SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCE LOCATED AT 242 WEST I STREET (07PLN-87)**

On motion of Commissioner White, seconded by Commissioner Conlow, the above Resolution was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Conlow, Donaghue, Mang and White  
Noes: None  
Absent: Commissioner Wilson and Chair Delgado  
Abstain: Commissioner Haughey

**RESOLUTION NO. 07-28 (HPRC) - A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF BENICIA RECOMMENDING CITY COUNCIL AUTHORIZE THE CITY MANAGER TO ENTER INTO A MILLS ACT CONTRACT FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 242 WEST I STREET**

On motion of Commissioner Conlow, seconded by Commissioner White, the above Resolution was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Conlow, Donaghue, Mang and White  
Noes: None  
Absent: Commissioner Wilson and Chair Delgado  
Abstain: Commissioner Haughey

**V. COMMUNICATIONS FROM COMMISSIONERS**

Commissioner Mang stated that he would like additional discussion on the Mills Act program. Gina Eleccion noted that there will be discussion and training from the State Office of Historic Preservation in January or February.

Commissioner Conlow commented that it would be best to have a workshop without projects on the agenda. Gina Eleccion stated that it is staff's intention to do this, however, based on timing and the Permit Streamlining Act, that is not always possible.

Commissioner Haughey would not like to have a deadline placed on applications. She also commented on the lack of Mills Act inspections.

Commissioner Donaghue would like the meetings to be more formal. He would like copies of the DMUMP for each Commissioner. He is committed to "green-building".

## **VI. COMMUNICATIONS FROM STAFF**

### **A. HISTORIC SURVEY AD HOC COMMITTEE UPDATE**

Gina Eleccion stated that the committee is continuing to review the survey forms. She acknowledged Commissioner Haughey and the amount of time she has spent reviewing each individual DPR form.

Gina Eleccion clarified that the Consent Calendar is not intended to "rubber-stamp" projects. Staff is following direction from the City Council in placing routine items that may not require discussion on the Consent Calendar. This allows the Commission time to focus on the projects that require lengthy discussion.

## **VII. ADJOURNMENT**

Commissioner Donaghue adjourned the meeting at 8:49 p.m.