



BENICIA HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION

CITY HALL COMMISSION ROOM

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, November 19, 2009

6:30 P.M.

I. OPENING OF MEETING

- A. Pledge of Allegiance**
- B. Roll Call of Commissioners**

Present: Commissioners Crompton, Donaghue, Mang, McKee, Taagepera, White and Chair Haughey

Absent: None

Staff Present:

Amy Million, Consulting Planner

Raquel Walsh, Recording Secretary

Sharon Williams, Development Services Technician

- C. Reference to Fundamental Rights of Public -** A plaque stating the Fundamental Rights of each member of the public is posted at the entrance to this meeting room per Section 4.04.030 of the City of Benicia's Open Government Ordinance.

II. AGENDA CHANGES AND DISCUSSION

Commissioner Mang requested to continue agenda item VI-B, Mills Act Inspections, to the next meeting. On motion of Chair Haughey, seconded by Commissioner Donaghue, and by the consensus of commissioners, this item was continued to December 17, 2009.

III. OPPORTUNITY FOR PUBLIC COMMENT

- A. WRITTEN**
None.
- B. PUBLIC COMMENT**
None.

IV. CONSENT CALENDAR

Commissioner White requested item IV-B, 660 West Second Street- Design Review, be removed from the Consent Calendar for discussion.

On motion of Commissioner White, seconded by Commissioner by Mang, the Consent Calendar, with the removal of item IV-B, was approved by the following vote:

- Ayes: Commissioners Crompton, Donaghue, Mang, McKee, Taagepera, White and Chair Haughey
- Noes: None
- Absent: None
- Abstain: None

A. Approval of Agenda

B. 660 WEST SECOND STREET (172 WEST G STREET) - DESIGN REVIEW FOR RECONFIGURATION OF THE DECK ON THE WEST SECOND STREET FAÇADE

09PLN-84 Design Review

660 West Second Street (172 West G Street), APN: 89-115-07

PROPOSAL:

The applicant requests design review approval to redesign the existing deck located on the west façade of an existing two-story non-contributing building located within the boundaries of the Downtown Historic Conservation District. The existing deck, which runs uninterrupted the entire length of the building, will be redesigned into two individual decks. Each deck will serve two apartment units.

Commissioner Taagapera recused herself from review and discussion of this project and departed the meeting room.

Recommendation: Approve design review request to reconfigure the existing deck to the four apartment units that front on the West Second Street alley, at 660 West Second Street (172 East G Street), based on the findings and conditions of approval set forth in the proposed resolution.

Amy Million, Consulting Planner, gave an overview of the project. Commissioner McKee posed a question to the property owner regarding the spacing of the 2X2’s forming the pickets and 4X4 spacing on the deck. The property owner explained that the 22 foot deck would be divided accordingly. Commissioners McKee and Donaghue further discussed and assisted the property owner with more specific spacing dimensions of the deck

RESOLUTION NO. 09-16 (HPRC) - A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF BENICIA APPROVING DESIGN REVIEW TO REDESIGN THE EXISTING DECK ALONG THE WEST SECOND STREET FAÇADE OF THE APARTMENT COMPLEX LOCATED AT 660 WEST SECOND STREET (172 WEST G STREET) (09PLN-84)

On motion of Commissioner Donaghue, with the addition of a condition that states the support posts be equally spaced, seconded by Commissioner McKee, the above Resolution was adopted by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Crompton, Donaghue, Mang, McKee, White and Chair
Haughey
Noes: None
Absent: None
Abstain: Commissioner Taagepera

V. REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

A. 464 EAST H STREET - DESIGN REVIEW TO MODIFY THE EXISTING WINDOWS, REMOVE AN EXISTING DOOR, ADD A NEW WINDOW AND REPLACE AN ENTRY DOOR

09PLN-86 Design Review
464 East H Street, APN: 80-171-15

PROPOSAL:

The applicant requests design review approval to replace and add windows on the east elevation, remove one window and one door on the south elevation with one new three-part window and replace the entry door on the recessed portion of the front elevation. The building is a contributing building to the Downtown Historic District, Eastern Residential Area.

Recommendation: Approve design review request to modify the existing windows, rear door and replace an entry door of the contributing building located at 464 East H Street, based on the findings and conditions of approval set forth in the proposed resolution.

Amy Million, Consulting Planner, gave an overview of the project.

The Commissioners discussed several aspects of the proposed window modifications. Commissioner Donaghue inquired whether or not the existing windows were double or single-paned. The homeowner indicated that they were single-paned. Commissioner Donaghue cited an error in the staff report and found the drawing to be incorrect. Commissioner McKee inquired about the grid pattern of the windows shown on the drawings.

The homeowner explained that he wanted to maintain a uniform look, and the windows shown on the drawing are not to scale. Commissioners Donaghue and Chair Haughey were concerned with the age of the current windows as well as the overall aesthetics of the replacement windows. Commissioners discussed the location of the windows and Commissioners Donaghue and White indicated the windows could not be seen from the sidewalk.

Further discussion included retaining the home's historical defining features, the Commission's jurisdiction over such changes, height of windows in relation to appliances and replacement window type. Commissioner Mang assisted fellow Commissioners as well as the homeowner with a suggestion of a specific window dimension and type of 2'6"

x 3'6" that would satisfy the needs of the homeowner as well as maintain the historical look of the home. The homeowner also indicated that the door would not be replaced, and he will have a carpenter repair the existing door to make true.

Commissioners requested the following modifications:

Condition No. 5 shall be modified to say: The two new windows on the east façade shall be 3ft 6in tall by 2ft 6in wide windows. The windows shall be two over two, wood clad, double hung windows, JELD-WEN TCD Traditional Plus Premium brand as proposed or equivalent.

Condition No.6 shall be modified to say: The new 3-in 1 window or 3 individual windows in the same design on the south façade shall be 8ft x 3ft windows. The design can also be for 2 windows with existing door. The windows shall be two over two, wood clad, double hung windows, JELD-WEN TCD Traditional Plus Premium brand as proposed or equivalent.

Condition No. 7 should be replaced with: The window trim for all new windows must be compatible with the trim of the existing house.

RESOLUTION NO. 09-17 (HPRC) - A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF BENICIA APPROVING DESIGN REVIEW TO ADD A NEW WINDOW AND REPLACE AN EXISTING WINDOW ON THE EAST FACADE, MODIFY THE EXISTING WINDOW AND DOOR ON THE SOUTH FACADE OF THE RESIDENTIAL BUILDING LOCATED AT 464 EAST H STREET (09PLN-86)

On motion of Commissioner Crompton, seconded by Commissioner White, the above Resolution was adopted by the following vote:

Ayes:	Commissioners Crompton, Donaghue, Mang, McKee, Taagepera, White and Chair Haughey
Noes:	None
Absent:	None
Abstain:	None

B. 721-727 FIRST STREET (IOOF) – CONSULTANT EVALUATION
09PLN-01 APN: 089-244-050

PROPOSAL:

In response to the Commission's request, a consultant was hired to evaluate the historic integrity of the IOOF Hall located at 721-727 First Street.

Recommendation: Review and discuss the consultant evaluation prepared by Urbana Preservation & Planning.

Amy Million, Consulting Planner gave a brief overview of the evaluation.

Commissioners discussed the evaluation. Commissioner Taagepera found problems with the report, specifically with the conclusions, recommendations, and an error in the memo on page three of the document, noting that the project was not presented to the HPRC for review. Additionally, she did not agree with the emergency status of the project or how the repair was conducted. She believes that staff did not have the authority to make a decision without further review. Commissioner Taagepera requested that staff come back with definition of “emergency and repair”. Other Commissioners agreed, and Chair Haughey requested a future agenda item be added for this issue. Commissioner Crompton added that verbiage should be written for future commissioners. Commissioners asked that Amy give clarification and create a definition of procedures as well.

VI. COMMUNICATIONS FROM STAFF

- A. LOWER ARSENAL HAZARDS UPDATE** – At its November 17, 2009 regular meeting, the City Council will discuss hazards investigation and, if necessary, cleanup of the former Benicia Arsenal, with priority given to the Draft Lower Arsenal Mixed Use Specific Plan area. Staff will provide the Commission and public with an update from that meeting.

Amy Million, Consulting Planner provided a verbal update from the November 17th City Council meeting.

Commissioners Mang and White agreed that discussion should continue at a future meeting as all of the Commissioners did not have the opportunity to read the related documents. Commissioner Taagepera indicated that she would like to conduct a workshop to discuss details and Commissioner White suggested the next meeting could be a workshop format. Commissioners expressed interest in having a workshop at their next meeting.

- B. MILLS ACT INSPECTIONS** – At the October 22nd meeting, Commissioner Mang requested that the Commission be involved in the Mills Act inspection process. Staff and the Commission will discuss this request.

This item was continued to December 19, 2009.

VII. COMMUNICATIONS FROM COMMISSIONERS

Commissioner Haughey asked that she replace Pat Donaghue as the representative on the Historic Context Committee. After a brief discussion, Commissioner Donaghue agreed to have Chair Haughey replace him and resigned. Commissioner Donaghue stated his resignation and Chair Haughey appointed herself to the position. Amy Million gave an informal approval. This will be agendized on the Consent Calendar of the December meeting for confirmation.

Commissioner McKee discussed starting a list of revisions for the downtown Mixed Use Master Plan and Chair Haughey requested revision items are agendized.

Commissioner Taagepera would like an update from staff regarding priority list of projects.

VIII. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Haughey adjourned the meeting at 8:18pm